

Item No: R1 Recommendation to Council
Subject: **PLANNING PROPOSAL - HERITAGE LISTING OF GEORGE S. GRIMLEY PAVILION (1926 BUILDING AND EASTERN SINGLE STOREY 1930S EXTENSION, INCLUDING INTERIORS), ROSE BAY**
Author: Shona Lindsay, Heritage Officer
Approvers: Chris Bluett, Manager - Strategic Planning
Allan Coker, Director - Planning & Development
File No: 20/23325
Reason for Report: To respond to Council's resolution of 23 April 2018 to investigate the heritage listing of the Woollahra Golf Clubhouse and the George S. Grimley Pavilion.
To obtain Council's approval to prepare a planning proposal to list the George S. Grimley Pavilion (1926 building and eastern single storey 1930s extension, including interiors) as a heritage item in Woollahra Local Environmental Plan 2014.
To obtain Council's approval for the planning proposal to be referred to the Woollahra Local Planning Panel for advice.

Recommendation:

- A. THAT a planning proposal be prepared to list the *George S. Grimley Pavilion (1926 building and eastern single storey 1930s extension, including interiors)* as a heritage item in *Woollahra Local Environmental Plan 2014*.
- B. THAT the planning proposal be referred to the Woollahra Local Planning Panel for advice.
- C. THAT the advice of the Woollahra Local Planning Panel be reported to the Environmental Planning Committee.

1. Background

On 23 April 2018 Woollahra Council resolved in part:

THAT Council requests staff to prepare and submit a report including a heritage assessment and draft heritage inventory sheet for each of:

1. *The Sydney Croquet Club building and greens (having its address in Woollahra Park, O'Sullivan Road, Rose Bay); and*
2. *The Woollahra Golf Club Clubhouse and George Grimley Pavilion (having its address in Woollahra Park at 50 O'Sullivan Road, Rose Bay)*

to the relevant Council Committee to facilitate the Sydney Croquet Club building and greens and the Woollahra Golf Club Clubhouse and George Grimley Pavilion (and their elements) being:

1. *Included in the Woollahra Local Environmental Plan as a heritage item; and*
2. *Listed as a heritage item of State significance on the NSW State Heritage Register.*

In response to Council's decision heritage significance assessments of the *George S. Grimley Pavilion* and *Woollahra Golf Clubhouse* were prepared by Weir Phillips Heritage and Planning.

2. The sites

George S. Grimley Pavilion and Woollahra Golf Clubhouse

The George S. Grimley Pavilion (Figure 1) and Woollahra Golf Clubhouse (Figure 2) are located within Woollahra Park, O'Sullivan Road, Rose Bay. Figure 3 shows the location of the clubhouse and pavilion within the park and Figure 4 shows an aerial photograph of the site.

The subject site is not listed on the NSW State Heritage Register (SHR), nor is it identified as a local heritage item or located in a heritage conservation area in Schedule 5 of *Woollahra Local Environmental Plan 2014* (Woollahra LEP 2014).



Figure 1: George S. Grimley Pavilion, south-western elevation (WP Heritage and Planning)



Figure 2: Woollahra Golf Clubhouse, north-eastern elevation (WP Heritage and Planning)



Figure 3: Location of buildings within Woollahra Park (SIX Maps; annotation in red by WP Heritage and Planning) Key: (1) George S. Grimley Pavilion; (2) Woollahra Golf Clubhouse.



Figure 4: Aerial photograph over the site. Key: (1) George S. Grimley Pavilion; (2) Woollahra Golf Clubhouse (Woollahra Council GIS).

3. Assessment of heritage significance

The assessment of heritage significance was undertaken in accordance with the document titled *Assessing heritage significance*, published by the NSW Heritage Office in 2001. The assessment used the process and criteria set out in that document. There are seven criteria used in the process of assessing heritage significance:

Criterion (a)

An item is important in the course, or pattern, of NSW's cultural or natural history (or the cultural or natural history of the local area).

Criterion (b)

An item has strong or special association with the life or works of a person, or group of persons, of importance in NSW's cultural or natural history (or the cultural or natural history of the local area).

Criterion (c)

An item is important in demonstrating aesthetic characteristics and/or a high degree of creative or technical achievement in NSW (or the local area).

Criterion (d)

An item has strong or special association with a particular community or cultural group in NSW (or the local area) for social, cultural or spiritual reasons.

Criterion (e)

An item has potential to yield information that will contribute to an understanding of NSW's cultural or natural history (or the cultural or natural history of the local area).

Criterion (f)

An item possesses uncommon, rare or endangered aspects of NSW's cultural or natural history (or the cultural or natural history of the local area).

Criterion (g)

An item is important in demonstrating the principal characteristics of a class of NSW's

- cultural or natural places, or
- cultural or natural environments,

(or a class of the local area's

- cultural or natural places, or
- cultural or natural environments.)

Each criterion has inclusion and exclusion guidelines which are used to assist in the assessment process. If an item meets one of the seven heritage criteria at a local level, and retains the integrity of its key attributes, it can be considered to have local heritage significance. To be assessed for State significance an item will meet more than one of the seven heritage criteria at a State level, or if an item satisfies only one of the criteria, the item is of such particular significance to NSW that it should be listed.

A copy of the assessment prepared by Weir Phillips Heritage and Planning, which includes the assessment against all criteria, is attached as **Annexure 1**.

George S. Grimley Pavilion

Table 1 below provides a summary of the assessment of the heritage significance of the *George S. Grimley Pavilion (1926 building and eastern single storey 1930s extension, including interiors)* against the seven criteria, at the local and State levels.

Table 1: NSW Heritage assessment criteria summary – George S. Grimley Pavilion (1926 building and eastern single storey 1930s extension, including interiors)

Criteria		Meets criteria for heritage listing and grading of significance	
		Local	State
(a)	An item is important in the course, or pattern, of NSW's cultural or natural history (or the cultural or natural history of the local area)	✓	✗
(b)	An item has strong or special association with the life or works of a person, or group of persons, of importance in NSW's cultural or natural history (or the cultural or natural history of the local area)	✓	✗
(c)	An item is important in demonstrating aesthetic characteristics and/or a high degree of creative or technical achievement in NSW (or the local area)	✓	✗
(d)	An item has strong or special association with a particular community or cultural group in NSW (or the local area) for social, cultural or spiritual reasons	✗	✗
(e)	An item has potential to yield information that will contribute to an understanding of NSW's cultural or natural history (or the cultural or natural history of the local area)	✗	✗
(f)	An item possesses uncommon, rare or endangered aspects of NSW's cultural or natural history (or the cultural or natural history of the local area)	✗	✗

(g)	<p>An item is important in demonstrating the principal characteristics of a class of NSW's</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • cultural or natural places; or • cultural or natural environments. <p>or a class of the local area's</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • cultural or natural places; or • cultural or natural environments. 	✓	✗
-----	--	---	---

The heritage significance assessment provides the following statement of significance for the *George S. Grimley Pavilion (1926 building and eastern single storey 1930s extension, including interiors)*:

The George S. Grimley Pavilion, Woollahra Park, Rose Bay, has historic and aesthetic significance at a local level. Designed by the architectural firm of E.A. Scott and Green and erected in 1926, it provides evidence of Council's interest in providing public recreational facilities in the 1920s, an interest that continues today. The pavilion commemorates George S. Grimley, a long serving alderman of Woollahra Council and Mayor in 1930-31, 1938-39 and 1945-46. The 1926 section of the building (south-western half) provides an example of an Inter-War period grandstand that was used not only for spectating, but also for varied community and private activities and functions. Significance resides only in the 1926 building and eastern single storey 1930s extension, including the interiors, which is substantially intact. The north-eastern side and the 1930s south-western extension (now used as the entrance to the pro shop) of the building demonstrates low integrity.

(February 2020: Weir Phillips Heritage and Planning:
Heritage Assessment, Rose Bay Scout Hall p. 59)

Woollahra Golf Clubhouse

Table 2 below provides a summary of the assessment of the heritage significance of the *Woollahra Golf Clubhouse* against the seven criteria, at the local and State levels.

Table 2: NSW Heritage assessment criteria summary – Woollahra Golf Clubhouse

Criteria		Meets criteria for heritage listing and grading of significance	
		Local	State
(a)	An item is important in the course, or pattern, of NSW's cultural or natural history (or the cultural or natural history of the local area)	✗	✗
(b)	An item has strong or special association with the life or works of a person, or group of persons, of importance in NSW's cultural or natural history (or the cultural or natural history of the local area)	✗	✗
(c)	An item is important in demonstrating aesthetic characteristics and/or a high degree of creative or technical achievement in NSW (or the local area)	✗	✗
(d)	An item has strong or special association with a particular community or cultural group in NSW (or the local area) for social, cultural or spiritual reasons	✗	✗

(e)	An item has potential to yield information that will contribute to an understanding of NSW's cultural or natural history (or the cultural or natural history of the local area)	x	x
(f)	An item possesses uncommon, rare or endangered aspects of NSW's cultural or natural history (or the cultural or natural history of the local area)	x	x
(g)	An item is important in demonstrating the principal characteristics of a class of NSW's <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • cultural or natural places; or • cultural or natural environments. or a class of the local area's <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • cultural or natural places; or • cultural or natural environments. 	x	x

The assessment recommends the listing of the *George S. Grimley Pavilion (1926 building and eastern single storey 1930s extension, including interiors)* as a local heritage item in Schedule 5 of Woollahra LEP 2014. The report concluded that the *George S. Grimley Pavilion (1926 building and eastern single storey 1930s extension, including interiors)* does not meet the threshold for State heritage listing. The assessment concludes that the *Woollahra Golf Clubhouse* does not reach the threshold for local or State heritage listing.

4. Consultation with the land owner

All land owners and lease holders were consulted during the heritage assessment process.

All land owners and lease holders, including Eastern Suburbs Rugby Club and Woollahra Golf Club, were provided a copy of the draft heritage significant assessment and draft heritage inventory sheet on 1 November 2019 for the relevant properties. The land owners and lease holders were given until the 2 December 2019 to make a submission.

Guy Gibson (General Manager, Woollahra Golf Club) attended the site visit with Alice Fuller (Weir Philips Heritage and Planning) and Shona Lindsay (Heritage Officer, Woollahra Council) in June 2019. Mr Gibson has reviewed the draft heritage significance assessment report and draft heritage inventory sheet for *George S. Grimley Pavilion*. He is supportive of the listing and his submission is included in **Annexure 2**.

An updated draft heritage significance assessment report and draft heritage inventory sheet were provided to the land owners and lease holders on 24 February 2020. The land owners and lease holders were given until 16 March 2020 to make a submission. No other comments were provided from the relevant land owners and lease holders.

Should a planning proposal proceed to public exhibition, consultation with land owners and tenants will continue.

5. Woollahra Local Planning Panel advice

Section 2.19 of the *Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979* sets out the functions of local planning panels. One of those functions is "to advise the council on any planning proposal that has been prepared or is to be prepared by the council under section 3.33 and that is referred to the panel by the council".

Additionally, the Local Planning Panel Direction – Planning Proposals which was issued by the Minister for Planning on 27 September 2018 identifies the types of planning proposals that are to be referred to a local planning panel for advice prior to a planning proposal being sent to the Department of Planning, Industry and Environment for a gateway determination.

The Direction states in part:

A Council to whom this direction applies is required to refer all planning proposals to be prepared after 1 June 2018 to the local planning panel for advice, unless the council's general manager determines that the planning proposal relates to:

- a) The correction of an obvious error in a local environmental plan,
- b) Matters that are of a consequential, transitional, machinery or other minor nature, or
- c) Matters that council's general manager considers will not have any significant adverse impact on the environment or adjoining land.

Items (a) and (b) are not relevant to a planning proposal which would be prepared for the matter currently before the Committee. Consideration under item (c) has been passed to the position of Director Planning and Development through the General Manager's delegations.

The Director Planning and Development has formed a view that he cannot be completely satisfied that the matter being dealt with by the planning proposal will have no significant adverse impact on the environment or adjoining land. Therefore under the terms of the Direction, the planning proposal to list the *George S. Grimley Pavilion (1926 building and eastern single storey 1930s extension, including interiors)* as a local heritage item must be referred to the Woollahra Local Planning Panel (Woollahra LPP) for advice. This step will be undertaken at the next available meeting of the Woollahra LPP should the Council decide to prepare a planning proposal.

6. Next steps

If Council supports the recommendation of this report, the next steps in the process are:

- Prepare a planning proposal under section 3.33 of the Act to list the property as a heritage item in the Woollahra LEP 2014.
- Report a draft planning proposal to the Woollahra LPP for advice.
- Report the advice received from the Woollahra LPP to the Environmental Planning Committee.
- Further steps will depend on advice from the Woollahra LPP and the decision of the Council following the Environmental Planning Committee meeting.


7. Conclusion

The heritage significance of the *George S. Grimley Pavilion* and *Woollahra Golf Clubhouse* have been assessed in accordance with the NSW heritage best practice guidelines. The assessments of heritage significance prepared by Weir Phillips Heritage and Planning identify that the *George S. Grimley Pavilion (1926 building and eastern single storey 1930s extension, including interiors)* is of local heritage significance for historical, associative, aesthetic, representative significance. *Woollahra Golf Clubhouse* does not have significance at a local or State level.

We recommend the listing of the *George S. Grimley Pavilion (1926 building and eastern single storey 1930s extension, including interiors)* as a local heritage item in Schedule 5 of Woollahra LEP 2014. *George S. Grimley Pavilion (1926 building and eastern single storey 1930s extension, including interiors)* does not meet the threshold for State heritage listing.

To facilitate a listing at the local level, a planning proposal should be prepared with the aim of amending Schedule 5 of Woollahra LEP 2014 by adding the *George S. Grimley Pavilion (1926 building and eastern single storey 1930s extension, including interiors)* to the list of heritage items. The planning proposal should be referred to the Woollahra LPP for advice.

Annexures

1. Heritage Significance Assessment for Woollahra Golf Clubhouse and George S. Grimley Pavilion [↓](#) 
2. Submission from lease holder for Woollahra Golf Clubhouse and George S. Grimley Pavilion [↓](#) 